

CALIFORNIA STATE UNIVERSITY SAN MARCOS

MASTER OF ARTS IN SPECIAL EDUCATION

TITLE:

AUTHOR(S):

DATE OF SUCCESSFUL DEFENSE:

PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF

MASTER OF ARTS IN SPECIAL EDUCATION

Xochitl Archey
COMMITTEE CHAIR

Xochitl Archey
SIGNATURE

Jul 28, 2020
DATE

Leslie Mauerman
COMMITTEE MEMBER

Leslie Mauerman
SIGNATURE

Jul 28, 2020
DATE

COMMITTEE MEMBER

SIGNATURE

DATE

COMMITTEE MEMBER

SIGNATURE

DATE

PBL FOR ENGLISH LEARNERS IN SOCIAL STUDIES

Project-Based Learning for Middle School English Language Learners

With Mild to Moderate Learning Disabilities

With an Emphasis in Social Studies

by

Gricelda M. Vizcaino

Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirements for the
Master of Arts Degree
in

Special Education

California State University San Marcos

Summer, 2020

Abstract

The project was guided by the need to support ELLs with disabilities and provide a deeper connection to social studies by creating templates for teachers to utilize PBL. The product of this project was a cluster of templates designed to support ELLs with disabilities using PBL during social studies. These templates will encourage teachers to use PBL to help their students connect to social studies lessons, develop language acquisition, work collaboratively, create more purposeful projects, and develop communication with members of their local and global communities. Teachers will be better equipped to guide and support their ELLs by engaging them at all phases of PBL in social studies. Furthermore, student engagement in PBL will better prepare students for future success in their advanced academic studies and professional careers.

Keywords: English language learners, language acquisition, Project-based learning, scaffolding strategies, disability, Visual Thinking Strategies

Acknowledgments

With endless gratitude to my parents Guadalupe and Martha Guzman, my brother Nicolas Guzman, my children Aileen, Carlos, America, my son-in-law Nathan, my godmother Francisca, my cousins Jen, Norma, Ricardo, Cesar, and Rene. To my friends Salvatore Cirincione, Nabil Noujaim for their support, patience, and understanding *what a rollercoaster ride!* To my friends Cristina, and Vanessa for their unwavering love and support. To Dr. Josue Ignacio Hernandez who encouraged me many years ago to pursue my passion in teaching. To my colleagues, and to *all* my professors especially Leslie Mauerman, Mike Norman, Dr. Rebecca Brooks, Dr. Xochitl Archey, Dr. Ana Hernandez, Dr. Ingrid Flores, and Martha Richardson who inspired and encouraged me throughout my journey . . . ~*thank you*

Con infinita gratitud a mis padres Guadalupe y Martha Guzmán, a mi hermano Nicolás Guzmán, a mis hijos Aileen, Carlos, América, a mi yerno Nathan, a mi madrina Francisca, a mis primos Jen, Norma, Ricardo, Cesar y René. A mis amigos Salvatore Cirincione, Nabil Noujaim por su apoyo, paciencia y comprensión *¡qué paseo en montaña rusa!* A mis amigas Cristina y Vanessa por su amor y apoyo inquebrantables. Al Dr. Josue Ignacio Hernández, quien me animó hace muchos años a perseguir mi pasión por la enseñanza. A mis colegas, y a *todos* mis profesores especialmente Leslie Mauerman, Mike Norman, la Dra. Rebecca Brooks, la Dra. Xochitl Archey, la Dra. Ana Hernández, la Dra. Ingrid Flores, y Martha Richardson que me inspiraron y alentaron a lo largo de mi viaje . . . ~*gracias*

Table of Contents

Abstract	ii
Chapter One Introduction.....	1
Purpose of Study.....	1
Significance of Project	2
Definition of Key Terms	2
Chapter Two: Literature Review.....	5
The Problem with Social Studies	5
The Importance of Social Studies	6
What is Project-Based Learning	8
Visual Thinking Strategies (VTS).....	11
The Effects of PBL on ELLs with Disabilities.....	12
Summary	19
Chapter Three: Methodology	21
Audience and Setting.....	22
Procedures for Developing the Project.....	22
Summary	23
Chapter Four: Results.....	24
Chapter Five: Discussion	28
Limitations of Project	29
Next Steps.....	30
Lessons Learned and Educational Implications	30
Conclusion.....	31
References	32
Appendix A: What is Your Learning Profile?	38
Appendix B: What is My Group Role?.....	39
Appendix C: What is Your Position?.....	40
Appendix D: What Do You See?.....	41
Appendix E: Key Vocabulary	42
Appendix F: Daily Reflection Guide	43
Appendix G: Creating a Driving Question for PBL	44
Appendix H: PBL Question Checklist.....	45
Appendix I: Presenting Your Project.....	46
Appendix J: Resources Needed to Complete the Project.....	47
Appendix K: Collaboration Evaluation.....	48
Appendix L: PBL Project Presentation Rubric	49

Chapter One

Introduction

The U.S. Department of Labor Secretary's Commission on Achieving Necessary Skills published a report in 1990 specifying the skills needed by young adults to thrive in the workplace. It emphasized the importance of being able to work collaboratively across hierarchical levels in multicultural environments, while utilizing interpersonal communication and conflict resolution skills (Kane et al., 1990). The traditional and antiquated model of teaching social studies where students quietly sit for long periods of time while passively listening to exhausting lectures of historical events does not prepare students for today's world (Edutopia, 2007). Students are left feeling disconnected from their peers and disengaged from their learning.

The purpose of Project-based learning (PBL) is to engage and motivate all students in their learning of subject matter as well as increase their interpersonal skills, develop collaboration, inspire creativity and accountability, and improve planning and organizational skills necessary for success in the 21st century workplace (Bell, 2010). In PBL, students solve real world problems or resolve broader questions or perplexities that challenge industries daily (Mergendoller et al., 2006). Utilizing their prior knowledge and experiences, students' knowledge is developed through an active and reflective process, social interactions, and multiple perspectives (Hernandez-Ramos and De La Paz, 2009). Students become the directors of their learning, while guided and mentored by their teachers (Edutopia, 2007).

Purpose of Study

Over the course of three years, working as a substitute teacher, the author has observed a considerable number of disengaged learners, specifically English language learners (ELLs) with

PBL FOR ENGLISH LEARNERS IN SOCIAL STUDIES

disabilities at the middle school level. Because of their lack of language development, some ELLs are regarded as incapable of participating in meaningful discussions with their peers during group activities or class discussions. To occupy their time, on several occasions ELLs are provided with activities to work on by themselves or they are sent to work with a special education teacher in an isolated resource room. Many times, these short-term solutions turn into behavior problems. Students become bored or they realize they are being treated differently than their peers. This problem, which many schools face drove the author to search for innovative strategies to support disengaged learners. The driving question for this project is: *How can 6th grade teachers of English language learners with mild to moderate learning disabilities support students in social studies using Project-based learning?*

Significance of Project

The significance of this project is to support ELLs and provide a deeper connection to social studies by creating templates for teachers to utilize during PBL. These templates will encourage teachers to use PBL to help their students connect to social studies lessons, develop language acquisition, work collaboratively, create more purposeful projects, and develop communication with members of their local and global communities. Teachers will be better equipped to guide and support their ELLs by engaging them at all phases of PBL. Furthermore, student engagement in PBL will better prepare students for future success in their advanced academic studies and professional careers.

Definition of Key Terms

English language learners (ELLs): students that speak a language other than English in their home that are expected to learn English, within a reasonable period of time, and achieve the

PBL FOR ENGLISH LEARNERS IN SOCIAL STUDIES

same rigorous grade-level academic standards expected of all students (California Department of Education, 2017).

Language acquisition: the product of a subconscious process of meaningful interaction in the target language in which the speaker concentrates on the communicative act (Krashen, 1981).

Project-based learning (PBL): A teaching method in which students gain knowledge and skills by working collaboratively for an extended period of time in heterogeneous groups to investigate and respond to an authentic, engaging, and complex question, problem, or challenge, to solve real world problems (Buck Institute of Education, 2018).

Scaffolding strategies: supports provided to students to help them learn a new concept or skill; removed once no longer necessary in order for students to achieve mastery and independence (Buck Institute of Education, 2018).

Disability: “A disorder in one or more of the basic psychological processes involved in understanding or in using language, spoken or written, that may manifest itself in the imperfect ability to listen, think, speak, read, write, spell, or to do mathematical calculations” (Individuals with Disabilities Education Act, 2004).

Social studies: Adopted by the California State Board of Education in 1998, these K-12 History–Social Science Content Standards emphasize historical narrative, highlight the roles of significant individuals throughout history, and convey the rights and obligations of citizenship. (California Department of Education, 2000).

Special education: specially designed instruction, at no cost to parents, to meet the unique needs of a child with a disability. Depending on the child’s needs, special education may be offered in a variety of ways and settings (Individuals with Disabilities Education Act, 2004).

PBL FOR ENGLISH LEARNERS IN SOCIAL STUDIES

Visual Thinking Strategies (VTS): teaching strategy based on the theory of aesthetic development, developed to accommodate the strengths and needs of viewers at different aesthetic stages; using their senses, personal associations, through observation, knowledge of the natural world, and critical thinking skills (Housen, 2002).

Chapter Two

Literature Review

Many school systems fall short in providing adequate support for English learners with learning disabilities at the middle school level. Specifically, in social studies students in general do not see or feel a connection to the history they are learning. According to Dewey (1938), a student should question the purpose of learning extraneous quantities of factual knowledge:

What is the purpose of learning “geography and history... the ability to write, if in the process the individual loses... appreciation for things worthwhile... loses desire to apply what he has learned and, above all, loses the ability to extract meaning from future experiences as they occur?” (p.49).

Overview

The Problem with Social Studies

At the national level social studies ranks significantly low for middle and high school students in relevance to students’ lives (Kingston, 2018). According to the National Assessment of Education Progress in History, many students, particularly, students with disabilities, have difficulties in social studies (National Center for Education Statistics, 2011). In general education 53% of seniors were below basic, whereas 85% of students with disabilities scored below basic (National Center for Education Statistics, 2011). In order to sustain our democratic republic, there is a dire need to prepare students for college, career readiness, and to become active participants in civic engagement (National Council for Social Studies, 2013). In general, students do not feel a connection to the history they are engaged in. Other research also has associated an inadequacy in historical knowledge among American citizens to increasing political

PBL FOR ENGLISH LEARNERS IN SOCIAL STUDIES

disengagement (National Education Association, 2017). Having limited knowledge and a lack of understanding of the way government operates, may lead citizens to less involvement in civic engagement.

The underlying research question guiding this literature review is: *How can 6th grade teachers of English language learners with mild to moderate learning disabilities support students in social studies using Project-based learning (PBL)?* In preparation for answering this question, this literature review examines the importance of social studies, what PBL is, and the effects of PBL on English language learners (ELLs) with disabilities. This literature review also examines the development of language acquisition, culturally responsive teaching, other teaching methods, and the challenges and benefits of PBL.

The Importance of Social Studies

Constructivist teaching philosophy emphasizes that any student is right to ask, what is the purpose of knowing so much about the past if it has no relevance to their present (Dewey, 1938); why does social studies matter (Vavilis & Vavilis, 2004)? One of the major components of social studies is that it is sequential; there is greater difficulty understanding ideas that follow if information or instruction is missed (WIDA, 2012). Students must learn the vocabulary needed and have an understanding of language usage to evaluate and participate in classroom discussions. When students fail to see the importance of knowing about the past and its relationship to the present there is also a lack of future college attendance, a deficiency in career opportunities and a vulnerability to social media (Litinov, 2012; National Council for the Social Studies, 2012).

Students involvement in PBL does not necessarily guarantee that students will attend college, however there may be a deeper connection to students' interest and focus in career

PBL FOR ENGLISH LEARNERS IN SOCIAL STUDIES

readiness using PBL versus traditional centered instruction. In a study focused on how PBL influenced secondary social studies students' academic achievement and College and Career Readiness (CCR), the study revealed higher and more positive CCR learning outcomes for students who learned via PBL. Furthermore, students outperformed their peers who learned from traditional methods of instruction (Summers & Dickson, 2012). Overall, because of their involvement in PBL students were more focused on pursuing higher education and they demonstrated a deeper understanding of the material they were learning through collaborative work amongst their peers.

The National Council for Social Studies NCSS (2013) summarizes the importance of social studies in its 2010 Principles for Learning, by stating that social studies is key to promoting student growth in multimodal literacy, awareness of learning as a social act, lasting skills of inquiry, multimedia skills, and knowledge of global context. The following are the social studies 2010 Principles for Learning:

1. Literacy is at the center of learning in every subject.
2. Learning is a social practice.
3. Learning about learning builds an atmosphere of inquiry, crucial in lifelong learning.
4. A component of learning is assessing progress.
5. Learning encompasses transforming information into knowledge utilizing multiple forms of media.
6. Learning occurs in a global context (NCSS, 2010, pp. 1-2).

Social studies offer unique opportunities for students to engage in all of these areas, more so than any other subject.

PBL FOR ENGLISH LEARNERS IN SOCIAL STUDIES

Complex thinking and contextual knowledge are needed for students to learn and understand social studies, which in many cases is not taught in a deliberate manner (Milner, 2014). Through reading, researching, and careful evaluation of past events, knowledge of historical context is built. For ELLs, an absence or lack of academic language can hinder their participation and limit their understanding of subject matter. Similar to mathematics, students will have greater difficulties understanding the steps that follow if part of the sequence is missed. The most essential real-life skills that students must possess for their future is critical thinking and communication skills (California Department of Education, 2016). Each state is responsible for providing relevant instructional practices that connect students to history, how history is connected to today's social structures, and how all these fundamentals are important in the way students participate in the world (California Department of Education, 2016). Additionally, relevant instructional practices are important in order to create leaders and not just receptacles of knowledge. The following section will address how PBL supports students in developing these essential life skills.

What is Project-Based Learning

Knowingly or unknowingly educators have used PBL for a considerable number of decades. Dewey (1910) says, "It is [education's] business to cultivate deep-seated and effective habits of discrimination... to develop a lively, sincere, and open-minded preference for conclusions ...and to ingrain into the individual's working habits methods of inquiry and reasoning" (p. 8). Greene (1997) proposes a cooperative model of learning which includes several points of view, where learning is not solely dependent on past narratives, but rather a compilation of meaningful and intellectual freedom. PBL offers a unique model of learning where students can think about or study what they want within the scope of their content area.

PBL FOR ENGLISH LEARNERS IN SOCIAL STUDIES

Currently, there are two components for Gold Standard PBL that consists of the Essential Project Design Elements, and Project Based Teaching Practices. The following are the 2014 Essential Project Design Elements:

1. Driving Question or Problem, to be answered or solved.
2. Sustained Inquiry, engages students in rigorous extended research process.
3. Authenticity, project involves real-world context or personal relation in students' lives.
4. Student Voice & Choice, students decide how they work and what they create.
5. Reflection, students and teachers reflect on the inquiry and project process.
6. Critique & Revision, students give, receive, and apply feedback to improve their work
7. Public Product, students display and/or present their project publicly beyond the classroom (BIE, 2018).

PBL provides students opportunities to learn collaboratively, to solve real-world problems by allowing them to decide how to demonstrate their learning, while receiving feedback from their peers to improve their work.

Student-Driven Inquiry. Authentic PBL is characterized by student-driven inquiry, by which students can access social studies (Larmer, 2014). Promoting self-direction, student motivation, and providing an assortment of modes of communication are other attributes of the experiences gained through PBL. The structure and impartiality of the projects are favorable to all students because they are provided with opportunities to achieve at their level (Westwood, 2006). Students are encouraged to participate when projects are within their reach and level of understanding.

PBL is one of the most effective and explicit teaching designs for equity due to its assurance for creating an appealing, cultural-relevant, and inclusive educational environment

PBL FOR ENGLISH LEARNERS IN SOCIAL STUDIES

(Larner, Mergendoller, & Boss, 2015). PBL is a teaching method which actively engages students in solving real-world problems through meaningful collaborative projects (Buck Institute of Education, 2018). Middle school students have substantial developmental needs, which include to connect with their peers, to ask their own questions, and engage in hands-on projects (Woolfolk, 2011). When they are not allowed to use their natural skills and abilities students are disengaged and unmotivated.

Teacher's role. Teachers play a crucial role in providing the platform to maintain student motivation and engagement. The following Project Based Teaching Practices of 2014 provides an overview of what is needed of teachers for the success of their students in PBL:

1. Design & Plan - teachers create/adapt a project for their context and students, plan its implementation start to finish while allowing student voice and choice.
2. Align to Standards – teachers address key knowledge from subject areas.
3. Build Culture - promote student independence and growth, open-ended inquiry, team spirit, and attention to quality.
4. Manage Activities – teachers collaborate with students to organize tasks and schedules; sets checkpoints and deadlines, find and use resources, create products and makes them public.
5. Scaffolding Student Learning - employs a variety of lessons, tools, instructional strategies to support all learners in attaining project goals.
6. Assess Student Learning - utilize formative and summative assessments of knowledge, including self and peer assessments of team and individual work.

PBL FOR ENGLISH LEARNERS IN SOCIAL STUDIES

7. Engage & Coach - engage in learning and creating with students, identify when students need skill-building, redirection, encouragement, and celebration (Buck Institute of Education, 2018).

One of the major struggles that teachers experience in PBL is to relinquish control over the classroom (Buck Institute of Education, 2018). With guidance teachers not only support their students; they also learn to improve their own teaching practice.

Scaffolding Strategies. In PBL, a variety of scaffolding strategies may be utilized to address the needs of struggling readers, including ELLs (Buck Institute of Education, 2018). When teaching lower achieving learners, it is important to maintain high expectations for all learners. Scaffolding students with language difficulties using applicable supplemental text and creating small heterogeneous groups is an important aspect of PBL. Grouping students in heterogeneous groups creates an opportunity for all learners to be involved in the classroom simultaneously creating a sense of belonging and community.

Visual Thinking Strategies (VTS)

VTS is an inquiry-based, learner-centered teaching method that utilizes visual art to increase student engagement, performance, develop critical-thinking, communication, visual literacy skills, and a joy for learning (Housen 1999, 2002; Yenawine 2003). VTS is a simple method where the teacher acts as the facilitator and asks students a set of questions while looking at images. Once all the students have responded, the teacher paraphrases what the students have said to demonstrate their understanding, to ensure all group members have heard the responses, and to validate student responses. By performing this method students begin to build their self-confidence and allow their voices to be heard.

PBL FOR ENGLISH LEARNERS IN SOCIAL STUDIES

VTS strategies provide educators with concrete steps to guide their students on how to support their conclusions (Housen, 1999). There are five stages of inquiry in VTS which include:

1. Accountive – concrete observations are made using senses, memories, and personal associations.
2. Constructive- use of logic and accessible tools: perception, knowledge of the natural world, values of their social, moral and conventional world.
3. Classifying- analytical and critical stances of the art historian are adopted.
4. Interpretive – students seek a personal encounter with the work of art.
5. Re-creative – having a long history of viewing and reflecting about works of art, students willingly suspend disbelief (VTS, 2020).

Students gain confidence in themselves as observers and critical thinkers, once VTS becomes a regular part of their routines to institute new topics (Housen, 2001). The following section will address the effects of PBL on ELLs with disabilities.

The Effects of PBL on ELLs with Disabilities

Inquiry based instruction, utilized in PBL, can produce greater outcomes for students who are low achieving, considered to be at-risk, and have a disability. Being integrated into general education classrooms places students with disabilities in situations where they may face challenges with cognition, difficulties expressing themselves orally and in written language, additionally difficulties with memory and attention. Oftentimes, students with a disability also struggle with expressing themselves in certain situations (Lerner, 2003). The strategies used in PBL, differentiation, scaffolding, and opportunities for students to learn at their own pace, are often used by special education teachers. Accordingly, PBL can be suitable in classrooms containing learners of mixed abilities.

Language Acquisition

In order for students to develop academic language to function effectively in an academic setting it may take up to seven years for them to thrive (Harley, Allen, Cummins, & Swain, 1990). The American Educational Research Association (AERA) notes that “unless a primary purpose of a test is to evaluate language proficiency, it should not be used with students who cannot understand the instructions or the language of the test” (American Education Research Association, 2000). The process of language acquisition can be addressed with the PBL model utilizing lessons that incorporate supports for ELLs (Yang & Gamble, 2013).

To further understand the development of language acquisition it is important to understand the two types of language ELLs are using and producing; basic interpersonal communication skills (BICS) and cognitive academic proficiency (CALP) (Cummins, 1984). When ELLs take in language ahead of their present level of understanding they acquire new language (Krashen, 1981). Cooperative learning in small groups and partner activities involved in PBL, engages students in applying both BICS and CALPS. Grouping students in heterogeneous groups is essential to ensure students are being challenged and engaged in their learning.

One of the fundamental strategies that are particularly useful in PBL is the emphasis on students working collaboratively to produce projects that demonstrate their own understandings (Buck Institute of Education, 2018). To meet and challenge students at all stages of language acquisition, PBL strategies promote the use of both BICS and CALP. Various routines are comprised of multimodal text, audio sources, visual images, and kinesthetic activities (Buck Institute of Education, 2018). Within their expert groups, students participate in critical thinking, reading, and writing activities, as well as developing informational paragraphs about new learned

PBL FOR ENGLISH LEARNERS IN SOCIAL STUDIES

knowledge to demonstrate in summative activities. Educators are able to incorporate activities and strategies in their classroom routines.

Culturally Responsive Teaching

The Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA, 2016), the reauthorization of No Child Left Behind Act of (2002) aims to provide an equal opportunities for all students including students who receive special education, students in poverty, minorities, and students with limited English language skills. ELLs represent more than 5 million students in the American public education system (K-12), of which 75% are Spanish speaking (Planty et al., 2009). More notably, less than 10% comprehend what they read at or above proficiency levels (National Center for Education Statistics, 2011). Due to the political tide of the of the 1990s which favored basic skills instruction, ELLs' cultural and linguistic experiences were excluded from literacy instruction (Orosco & O'Connor, 2014). ELLs are faced not only with the challenge of achieving academic success but moreover in overcoming a language barrier.

When ELLs enter the classroom, they bring with them a plethora of cultural and linguistic knowledge, but many of them encounter barriers in their schooling that forces them to separate their personal learning experiences, which negatively affects their acquisition of reading instruction (Snow, 2002). ELLs come from homes and communities that emphasize interdependence, sharing and collaboration, which is contrary to the instruction they receive at school which promotes a more individualistic approach (Orosco & O'Connor, 2014). Research results indicate that the success of special education with ELLs might be dependent on how well culturally responsive instruction is integrated (Orosco & O'Connor, 2014). PBL promotes interdependence, sharing, and collaboration that is part of ELLs' cultural background. The

PBL FOR ENGLISH LEARNERS IN SOCIAL STUDIES

following section will address PBL for ELLs with disabilities and some of the benefits and challenges.

PBL for ELLs with Disabilities

From the formal realization of PBL in the 1990s, researchers have studied the effects of PBL, which have suggested social and academic benefits of PBL on middle school students (Bottge, 2001). More extensive research suggests that PBL is perceived as an effective measure when working with diverse populations, such as ELLs and exceptional students (Hovey & Ferguson, 2014). Specifically, teachers who have more experience with special education and/or ELL populations are more likely to support the use of PBL with these student groups (Hovey & Ferguson, 2014).

Providing students with a choice to interpret or express their learning and understanding is a highly engaging aspect of PBL for students with disabilities. Granting students, the opportunity to pursue their interests within the context of their learning, provides them with a sense of control over their education which facilitates their interest and motivation (Bell, 2010). When deciding on their sources of information, students select materials pertinent to their level or they are inspired to read material slightly above their reading level (Bell, 2010). To reflect on the selections they have made, a journal or structured group dialogue is part of student choice (Bell, 2010). Additionally, students select their form of expression to validate their learning through either video, presentation, essay, or portfolio.

Commonly, a strategy utilized for students with disabilities, scaffolded instruction, a series of temporary levels of support is a component of PBL (Bell, 2010). Gradually, as a student achieves mastery or achievement of academic goal the support is removed or diminished. Once

PBL FOR ENGLISH LEARNERS IN SOCIAL STUDIES

the student is able to perform the task independently the support is completely removed. Without scaffolded instruction, students would unlikely make adequate academic progress (Bell, 2010).

For students that have not yet developed and acquired the skills and abilities necessary to fully engage in the content, working in collaborative projects similar to those found in PBL provides students with opportunities to engage with various texts at their level and slightly above. The experiences and prior knowledge students bring with them function as supports to engage them in higher order critical thinking, writing, and literacy and a deeper level of understanding and connection of social studies content (Gay, 2010; Misco, 2014). Furthermore, students engage with their peers to develop their social, emotional, and communication skills to find their place in the world.

Benefits of PBL

Student Self-Concept. One of the design principles of PBL is linking students' prior knowledge to their present experiences to create meaningful learning. Students, especially middle school students, transitioning from preadolescence to adolescence need to feel a sense of belonging. PBL provides the social aspect of learning while supporting students to construct their own inquiry (Maslow, 1954). Students thrive when having roles and routine, PBL incorporates roles and routines that enhances student self-concept (Savitz, 2016). As students work collaboratively, they begin to see themselves as valued members of their team and community.

Increased engagement and positive attitude. Wurdinger et al. (2007) notes that PBL has the potential to motivate students to learn more effectively than passive teaching approaches and encourages teachers to experiment with PBL in their own classrooms. Through observations, studies have shown an increase in student and teacher engagement and positive attitudes towards work. Additionally, the shift of roles between the teacher and student has provided a different

PBL FOR ENGLISH LEARNERS IN SOCIAL STUDIES

sense of leadership. Once teachers are informed and prepared, they are able to focus more on guiding their students through the process. However, the initial phase of PBL requires an extensive amount of planning, some students produce more work than others, and it is difficult for teachers to relinquish control to allow students to make mistakes or misuse their time during the process (Wurdinger et al., 2007). In spite of some of the challenges of PBL, the following research provides another benefit to support the implementation of PBL.

In a research study conducted by Hernandez-Ramos and De La Paz (2009) the study focused on two middle schools in Northern California and students' ability to learn historical information. The purpose of the study was to explore the impact of constructivist pedagogical approach that involved technology integration and PBL; teaching and learning history in middle school. Students who completed the unit in cooperative groups to create multimedia projects, learned more than students in the comparison group consistent with results from the teacher-created test (Hernandez-Ramos & De La Paz, 2009). Students also reported having an improved attitude and engagement with social studies as a result of PBL (Hernandez-Ramos & De La Paz, 2009). Working in collaborative, heterogenous groups students were more engaged in their learning and able to support one another to accomplish their objectives.

Coping Skills. The high demands of school performance and schoolwork can cause an extreme amount of stress on students. Learning appropriate coping skills to deal with stressors in school such as problems with teachers, workload, exams, and parental expectations, can play an important role in students' academic engagement and success (Burnett & Fanshawe, 1997; Wolchick & Sandler, 1997). Adolescents transitioning to middle school who are able to utilize approach coping skills early on in the school year have less difficulty adjusting versus students who utilize avoidance coping (Causey and Dubow, 1993). Teaching students appropriate coping

PBL FOR ENGLISH LEARNERS IN SOCIAL STUDIES

skills can help avoid or diminish problematic behavior that can negatively affect student performance. Teaching students to meet their needs to prevent disruptive behavior through learned responsibility, can improve classroom discipline and empower students for a lifetime (Kagan, Kyle, & Scott, 2004).

Challenges of PBL

Fixation with Numbers. “Americans want numbers when they look at students, schools, state education systems, and how America’s students compare to those of other countries” (Barton, 1999, p. 4). The 2017 reevaluation of Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA) of 2015, which replaced the 2001 No Child Left Behind (NCLB) has difficulties in serving impoverished, minority, ELLs, and other disadvantaged students. Yet, they sanction the advancement of charter schools that funnel public money from public schools (Ladd, 2017). Regardless of their abilities, standardized testing requires 95% of students to test, and public schools struggling to meet the needs of their learners are punished by receiving less funding when their students underperform (Ladd, 2017).

High Stakes Testing. Due to high stakes standardized testing, teachers are discouraged to use PBL (Wurdinger et al. 2007). Prior to the Common Core the state of Florida dealt with a difficult situation with the NCLB and challenges faced by ELLs. The Florida Comprehensive Assessment Test (FCAT) is Florida’s high-stake measure of student achievement test; which is similar to the California High School Exit Exam. In order for students to graduate from high school, they had to pass the FCAT. Nearly 8.7% of Florida’s students or approximately one quarter million had limited English proficiency, and due to Florida’s policies many ELLs were prevented from obtaining a Standard High School Diploma and attending college (Giambo,

PBL FOR ENGLISH LEARNERS IN SOCIAL STUDIES

2010). Over the years, this has led many professional educational organizations to call for appropriate revisions to high-stake testing requirements (Giambo 2010).

Evaluation through rubrics. PBL success is not measured through standardized testing, it is evaluated through the use of rubrics and constructive criticism provided by team members, and self-evaluations were students become conscience of their personal strengths (Bell, 2010). In a research study conducted in the state of Iowa, using PBL one school raised scores on the *Test of Basic Skills* from “well below average” to the district average, and two schools raised their score to “well above average” (Thomas, 2000). In a Boston middle school, using PBL eight graders achieved the second highest scores in the district on the *Stanford 9 Open Ended Reading Assessment* (Thomas, 2000). On the Main Educational Assessment Battery, middle schools in Maine raised their scores significantly, 3 to 10 times more than the state average, after using PBL for 1 year (Thomas, 2000). PBL is a process that requires an extensive amount of time to plan and design. However, by frequent engagement in PBL students achieve higher scores on state standardized testing in comparison to their peers who obtain traditional direct instruction (Geier et al., 2008).

Summary

Contrary to the traditional instructional model, the numerous features provided by PBL enables teachers to adapt instruction to students’ needs (Thomas, 2000). Because of its potential to utilize teamwork and cooperative learning skills, PBL stimulates disengaged and unmotivated students (Wurdinger et al., 2007). Low performing students are supported when questions arise and encouraged to participate by their peers. For students with learning difficulties this creates an opportunity for them to apply problem-solving strategies (Filappatou & Kaldi, 2010). In PBL, students with disabilities demonstrate more engagement in contrast to traditional teaching which

PBL FOR ENGLISH LEARNERS IN SOCIAL STUDIES

obligates students to sit for long periods of time and take a more passive approach to their learning (Filappatou & Kaldi, 2010). Furthermore, rubrics encourage student growth by allowing “room to progress”. For example, if a student is at a 1, they can see that there is also a 2 and a 3 category and corresponding criteria that they can achieve in the future. Feedback is only important when it actually shows students where they are, where they need to be, and how to get there (Hattie, ???). Through the use of rubrics, PBL allows students to see where they are, where they need to be, and how they can get to where they need to be.

Chapter Three

Methodology

Teachers that teach English language learners (ELLs) with mild to moderate learning disabilities face many challenges in their classroom. Many general education teachers are unaware of the of the unique developmental characteristics of ELLs. This project is centered around the following question: *How can 6th grade teachers of English language learners with mild to moderate learning disabilities support students in social studies using Project-based learning?* With guidance teachers can help students navigate through the PBL process.

The purpose of this project was to design templates to support ELLs with mild to moderate learning disabilities in middle school during social studies using PBL. The information in the templates was informed by the literature review that was conducted by the researcher. The templates provide teachers with (a) information that addresses language acquisition for ELLs (b) coping skills for students with learning disabilities and (c) the major elements of PBL, such as the project question, collaboration, and reflection. The templates are intended to help both general education and special education teachers, who are not PBL experts or who may not have extensive training in PBL, to understand and better support ELLs with disabilities.

The templates are intended to support students in social studies during PBL. Each template was designed to support students through the PBL process as well as to guide teachers in addressing specific needs and challenges that their students may face. Students will read and answer questions according to each template. Certain templates will require students to write complete sentences while others may require a yes or no answer. The templates will be provided in English with a Spanish translation that will allow ELLs to progress in acquiring academic language. Another component of the templates will include different scaffolding strategies that

PBL FOR ENGLISH LEARNERS IN SOCIAL STUDIES

include sentence starters, selection of comments, and a user-friendly layout. This will provide ELLs with disabilities a variety of opportunities to interact with their peers and succeed along with the general education population.

Audience and Setting

These templates were designed to be used by general education teachers and special education teachers during social studies instruction to support students using PBL. When developing the templates, the researcher's intended audience was the middle school in which she works. The majority of the student population is Hispanic of low-socioeconomic status. The middle school serves students from surrounding elementary schools and a small percentage of intra-district transfers. The school district has a student diversity that includes Cantonese, Russian, Spanish, Arabic, Filipino, Samoan, Vietnamese, and other populations.

Procedures for Developing the Project

To create the templates for teachers of ELLs with disabilities, the researcher followed the steps below.

1. Review research-based recommendations for instruction and academic interventions for English language learners
2. Meet with support personnel to discuss how intervention practices and procedures are implemented, and areas that require improvement
3. Review elements of PBL; project question, collaboration, and reflection
4. Select the major topics and sections in the templates
5. Create templates with supports and important information teachers of ELLs with disabilities can utilize to support students during PBL
6. Review the template layouts to assure they provide clear information

PBL FOR ENGLISH LEARNERS IN SOCIAL STUDIES

7. Provide a title for each template that specifies its purpose

Summary

The content and steps of each template were selected to best support ELLs with disabilities in order for them to be successful in social studies using PBL. The use of these templates provides both general education teachers and special education teachers with guidance to better support ELLs with disabilities, and to increase student engagement and success. It should be noted that while the literature review focuses on social studies instruction, these templates are unrestricted and available to teachers of all content areas to modify and adapt but they are specifically intended for middle school. Furthermore, it is the researcher's hope that with the use of these templates, students develop a more positive attitude and unique learning experience in social studies using PBL.

Chapter Four

Results

ELLs are faced with many challenges, moreover ELLs with disabilities that are entering middle school. Unfortunately, often times ELLs with disabilities are regarded as incapable of participating in meaningful classroom discussions or group activities. The outcomes of these views have produced a considerable number of disengaged learners, specifically ELLs with disabilities at the middle school level. Regrettably, to occupy their time, ELLs are provided with activities to work on by themselves or they are sent to work in an isolated resource rooms with a special education teacher. These short-term solutions turn into behavior problems once students realize they are being treated differently than their peers, or they become bored and disengaged due to their lack of language development.

Through research and current literature, the author concluded that a set of templates to support ELLs with disabilities in middle school was necessary to guide students through the stages of PBL during social studies. The researcher developed a set of templates to utilize during the different stages of PBL to support disengaged learners in social studies. The templates are designed to support ELLs with disabilities with the purpose of engaging and motivating all students in their learning of subject matter as well as increase their interpersonal skills, develop collaboration, inspire creativity and accountability, and improve planning and organizational skills necessary for success in the 21st century workplace.

The templates are organized in a sequence that addresses the needs of the students, but they can be utilized in a variety of ways depending on the needs of the students. The templates are intended for student use with guidance from a teacher. The templates are designed utilizing the major parts of PBL including introduction of key vocabulary, developing the project

PBL FOR ENGLISH LEARNERS IN SOCIAL STUDIES

question, reflection, and collaboration. The templates are designed to be used by teachers who may not have access to extensive training in PBL and who are not PBL experts. It should be noted that the templates are not designed to include the entire PBL process, particularly the work developed by students toward the project presentation. The appealing part of PBL is that it has the capacity to lead students just about anywhere. The expertise of the special educator can compensate wherever there may be a void in these templates in meeting the needs of all students.

The templates offer a concrete starting point for PBL. Appendix A – What is Your Learning Profile? starts with an activity that guides teachers through the planning stages of PBL. This template should be used at the beginning of PBL planning in getting to know your students. This template informs teachers how their students like to learn, stressors to avoid that may impact student learning, and how teachers can group students. Appendix B – What is My Group Role?, can be used to support students throughout PBL. It specifies the role of students when they are placed in heterogeneous groups. It provides specific information in both English and Spanish of the duties and tasks of each group member. This template may be enlarged and used as a poster to be placed on a wall to provide team members with added support in helping them remember their responsibilities. Appendix C – What is Your Position?, is an activity that may be developed more extensively. It discusses the seven positions of Win-Win strategies to support student coping skills throughout PBL. This template may also be enlarged and used as a poster to be placed on a wall to provide students with added support in helping them utilize appropriate coping strategies.

Once teachers have placed students in heterogeneous groups they may utilize Appendix D – What Do You See?, to activate and build on students prior knowledge. This template should be used at the beginning and/or throughout PBL as needed. Appendix E – Key Vocabulary,

PBL FOR ENGLISH LEARNERS IN SOCIAL STUDIES

should be used at the beginning stages of PBL to introduce students to new/key vocabulary needed for ELLs to develop language acquisition and academic language. Appendix F – Daily Reflection Guide, should be used daily during PBL in order for students to reflect on their project progress. Appendix G Creating a Driving Question for PBL, focusses on an activity that guides students in developing their driving question. In this template students are provided with examples of project questions. This is followed by Appendix H – PBL Question Checklist, which provides students with an opportunity to reflect and discuss their project question as a group. Students are provided with specific criteria needed to improve their question. Appendix I – Presenting Your Project, may be utilized in PBL with group members to decide how to present the project once the project question has been established. To complete the project with group members Appendix J – Resources Needed to Complete the Project, needs to be utilized with group members in order to decide on the resources needed to complete the project. The next template Appendix K – Collaboration Evaluation, focuses on the process of PBL and the 21st century skills of problem solving and collaboration. Students view a checklist of collaboration skills and asses their skills as well as those of their peers. The final template Appendix L – PBL Project Presentation Rubric, is a project rubric. This rubric is intended to allow teachers to add and/or exclude items to better meet their students’ needs. It is also intended to provide students with valuable feedback of where they are, where they need to be, and how they can get to where they need to be.

The overall intention of the literature review focuses on how to support middle school ELLs with disabilities in social studies during PBL, it should be noted that these templates are not specific to social studies. The researcher developed these templates to be more open-ended,

PBL FOR ENGLISH LEARNERS IN SOCIAL STUDIES

in order to make the templates accessible to teachers of all content areas specifically for middle school and high school.

Chapter Five

Discussion

Teachers of ELLs with a disability can improve their students' outcomes with various supports during the PBL process. Teachers can support their students in the planning phase of PBL by scaffolding the project or content. Some of the unique scaffolds afforded by PBL are connecting to students' interests, creating opportunities for student conversation and discussion, and an opportunity to work with peers. Understanding ELLs cultural background, how ELLs acquire language, providing scaffolds, and coping skills for ELLs with disabilities are key elements in students' academic success. The project was guided by the need to support ELLs with disabilities and provide a deeper connection to social studies by creating templates for teachers to utilize PBL. The product of this project was a cluster of templates designed to support ELLs with disabilities using PBL during social studies. These templates will encourage teachers to use PBL to help their students connect to social studies lessons, develop language acquisition, work collaboratively, create more purposeful projects, and develop communication with members of their local and global communities. Teachers will be better equipped to guide and support their ELLs by engaging them at all phases of PBL in social studies. Furthermore, student engagement in PBL will better prepare students for future success in their advanced academic studies and professional careers.

Several templates will require students to write complete sentences while others may require a yes or no answer. In addition, the templates will be provided in English with a Spanish translation that will allow ELLs to progress in acquiring academic language. Another component of the templates will include different scaffolding strategies that include sentence starters, selection of comments, and a user-friendly layout. This will provide ELLs with disabilities a

PBL FOR ENGLISH LEARNERS IN SOCIAL STUDIES

variety of opportunities to interact with their peers and succeed along with the general education population. During the project development phase, PBL provides students with these essential skills as well as working collaboratively with team members, and other members of their local and global communities. In this chapter the limitation of the project, next steps, lessons learned, and the educational implications will be addressed.

Limitations of Project

One of the limitations of this project is that it has yet to be reviewed by educational professionals familiar with ELLs, special education and PBL. The next step for this project is for the templates to be vetted by colleagues, ELL teachers, special education teachers, administrators, and PBL experts to determine readability and validity. During the vetting process pertinent information and other resources will be gathered to best support ELLs during the PBL process.

A second limitation of this project is that it has not been thoroughly reviewed for translation into Spanish and other primary languages used by ELLs in a school district who may benefit from the use of the templates during PBL. Finding qualified translators and having ELL students preview translations to verify the accuracy of meaning and clarity of the information would be a second step for this project.

Another limitation of this project is the great variance there is with the special education population. There are thirteen disability categories with sub disabilities within each category and with varying levels of severity. Furthermore, it is not just for students with disabilities that this project is intended for but for ELLs with disabilities, which there is not a lot of research on.

Next Steps

PBL FOR ENGLISH LEARNERS IN SOCIAL STUDIES

For the purpose of social validity, there will be a step 8 in the vetting process of the templates, which includes the critical examination of the templates by colleagues. The templates will be distributed to colleagues to determine readability and validity. The researcher will collect written feedback from colleagues and make appropriate changes and additions to improve the templates.

Once the project has been vetted and reviewed for proper translation, it will be utilized to support ELLs with a disability in social studies during PBL. The researcher will collaborate with colleagues that have prior experience in PBL and are interested in PBL to improve the success of ELLs with a disability in social studies. Once colleagues witness the positive outcomes specifically in literacy, language acquisition, 21st century learning skills, increased student engagement, development of critical thinking skills, improved self-concept, and their own understanding of cultural literacy, PBL may be implemented on a grander scale school wide.

It is the researchers hope that this project will be utilized by general education and special education teachers alike to support ELLs with disabilities in social studies and other content areas during PBL. With the support of school administration, faculty, staff, and the surrounding community the project can be extended to support ELLs and ensure their success in high school and in their pursuit of higher education and career development.

Lessons Learned and Educational Implications

By creating this project, through the development of the templates, the researched learned the importance of providing adequate supports for ELLs in social studies through the PBL process. Although there is an extensive amount of information on the Internet for educators to utilize with their students during PBL, there is not much information or supports for ELLs with disabilities. The researcher also learned that many of the supports provided in social studies

PBL FOR ENGLISH LEARNERS IN SOCIAL STUDIES

through PBL can be applied to other content areas to further support ELLs with disabilities and the general education population.

Conclusion

“We must be the change we want to see in the world.” ~ Mahatma Gandhi

Educators have a responsibility to provide adequate supports for all students. Working with a diverse population of students in middle school can be extremely challenging for even the most experienced educators but it can be even more daunting for ELLs with a disability. With adequate supports and the use of PBL, students of diverse cultural backgrounds and different levels of academic performance can be supported in social studies and other content areas. The major attributes of PBL; student-driven inquiry, collaboration, cultural background, and language supports affords several opportunities to access content at multiple points so that it is inclusive of *all* students including students with disabilities.

References

Journal Articles

- Bell, S. (2010). Project-based learning for the 21st century: skills for the future. *Clearing House*, 83(2), 39-43. doi: 10.1080/00098650903505415
- Bottge, B.A. (2001). Building ramps and hovercrafts-and improving math skills. *Teaching Exceptional Children*, 34(1),16-23.
- Burnett, P. C., & Fanshawe, J. P. (1997). Measuring school-related stressors in adolescents. *Journal of Youth and Adolescence*, 26, 415–428.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1023/A:1024529321194>
- Causey, D. L., & Dubow, E. E. (1993). Negotiating the transition to junior high school: The contributions of coping strategies and perceptions of the school environment. *Prevention in Human Services*, 10, 59–81. http://dx.doi.org/10.1300/J293v10n02_05
- Filippatou, D., & Kaldi, S. (2010). The effectiveness of project-based learning on pupils with learning difficulties regarding academic performance, group work, and motivation. *International Journal of Special Education*, 25(1), 17-26.
- Geier, R., Blumefield, P. C., Marx, R. W., Krajcik, J. S., Soloway, E., and Clay-Chambers, J. (2008). Standardized test outcomes for students engaged in inquiry-based curricula in the context of urban reform. *Journal of Research in Science Teaching*, 45(8), 922-939. doi: 10.1002/tea.20248
- Greene, M. (1997). Metaphors and multiples: Representation, the arts, and history. *Phi Delta Kappan*. 78(5). 387-392.
- Harley, B., Allen, P. Cummins, J. & Swain, M. (1990). *The development of second language*

PBL FOR ENGLISH LEARNERS IN SOCIAL STUDIES

- proficiency*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Hattie, J., Timperley, H. (2007). The power of feedback. *Review of Educational Research*, 77(1), 81-112.
- Hernandez-Ramos, P., & De La Paz, S. (2009). Learning history in middle school by designing multimedia in a project-based learning experience. *Journal of Research on Technology in Education*, 42(2), 151-173.
- Housen, A. (2002). Aesthetic thought, critical thinking and transfer. *Arts and Learning Research Journal*, 18(1), 99-131. Retrieved from www.vtshome.org/system/resources/0000/0014/Aesthetic_thought.pdf
- Hovey, K.A. & Ferguson, S.L. (2014). Teacher perspectives and experiences: Using project-based learning with exceptional and diverse students. *Curriculum and Teaching Dialogue*, 16(1), 77-90.
- Kingston, S. (2018). Project based learning & achievement: What does the research tell us? *PBL Evidence Matter*. 1(1). 1-11. <http://bie.org/x9JN>
- Krashen, S. (1981). Bilingual education and second language acquisition theory. California Department of Education (Ed.), *Schooling and language minority students: A theoretical framework*. Los Angeles: California State University. 51-79.
- Ladd, H. F. (2017). No child left behind: A deeply flawed federal policy. *Journal of Policy Analysis and Management*. Retrieved from <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/full/10.1002/pam.21978>
- Lam, S., Cheng, R., & Choy, H. (2010). School support and teacher motivation to implement project-based learning. *Learning and Instruction*, 20(6), 487-497.
- Litinov, A. (2017). Forgotten purpose: Civics education in public schools. *NEA Today*.

PBL FOR ENGLISH LEARNERS IN SOCIAL STUDIES

Retrieved from <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/00098655.2014.938598>

- Milner, H. R. (2014). Culturally relevant, purpose-driven learning & teaching in a middle school social studies classroom. *Multicultural Education*, 21(2), 9-17.
- Misco, T. (2014). Powerful social studies unit design: A companion to powerful social studies teaching and learning. *Clearing House*; Nov 2014, Vol. 87 Issue 6. 241-248.
- Mutakinati, L., Anwari, I., & Kumano, Y. (2018). Analysis of students' critical thinking skill of middle school through STEM education project-based learning. *Journal Pendidikan IPA Indonesia*, 7(1), 54-65.
- Orosco, M.J., & O'Connor, R. (2014). Culturally responsive instruction for English language learners with learning disabilities. *Journal of Learning Disabilities*, 47(6) 515-531. doi 10.1177/0022219413476553
- Planty, M., Hussar, W., Snyder, T., Kena, G., KewalRamani, A., Kemp, J., & Dinkes, R. (2009). *The condition of education 2009* (NCES 2009-081). Washington, DC: U.S. Department of Education, Institute of Education Sciences, National Center for Educational Statistics.
- Summers, E., Dickinson, G. (2012). A longitudinal investigation of project-based instruction and student achievement in high school social studies. *Interdisciplinary Journal of Problem-Based Learning*, 6(1).
- Thomas, J.W. (2000). A review of research on project-based learning. Retrieved from <http://www.bie.org/images/uploads/general/9d06758fd346969cb63653d00dca55c0.pdf>
- Vavilis, B.; Vavilis, S. L. (2004). Why are we learning this? What is this stuff good for, anyway? *Phi Delta Kappan*, 86(4), 282.
- Wolchik, S. A., & Sandler, I. N. (Eds.). (1997). *Handbook of children's coping: Linking theory*

and intervention. New York, NY: Plenum Press. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4757-2677-0>

Wurdinger, S., Haar, J., Hugg, R., & Bezon, J. (2007). A qualitative study using project-based learning in a mainstream middle school. *Improving Schools*, 10(2), 150-161.

Yang, Y. and Gamble, J. (2013). Effective and practical critical thinking-enhanced EFL instruction. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Yenawine, P. (2003). Jump starting visual literacy. *Art Education*, 56 (1), 6-12.

Books

Cummins, J. (1984). Bilingual and special education: Issues in assessment and pedagogy. San Diego: College-Hill Press.

Dewey, J. (1938). *Experience & Education*. Collier-Macmillan Canada Ltd.

Gay, G; (2010). *Culturally responsive teaching: Theory, research, and practice*. (2nd ed.). New York: Teachers College Press.

Kagan, S., Kyle, P., & Scott, S. (2004). *Win-win discipline: Strategies for all discipline problems*. San Clemente, CA: Kagan Publishing.

Larmer, J., Mergendoller, J., and Boss, S. (2015). *Setting the standard for project based learning: A proven approach to rigorous classroom instruction*. Alexandria, VA: ASCD.

Lerner, J. (2003). *Learning disabilities: theories, diagnosis and teaching strategies*. (9th ed), Boston, MA: Houghton Mifflin Co.

Westwood, P. (2006). *Teaching and learning difficulties: Cross-curricular perspectives*. Camberwell, Victoria, Canada: ACER Press.

Woolfolk, A. (2011). *Educational Psychology* (11th ed.). Boston: Pearson Education, Inc.

Online Articles

Barton, P. E. (1999). Too much testing of the wrong kind: Too little of the right kind in k-12 education. New Jersey: *Policy Information Center*. Retrieved from <http://www.ets.org/Media/Research/pdf/PICTOOMUCH.pdf>

Hilliker, E. (2017, May 18). Top five vocabulary strategies for English language learners. Retrieved from <https://www.teachingchannel.com/blog/top-five-vocabulary-strategies-for-english-language-learners>

Housen, A. (1999, September 27-29). *Eye of the beholder*. Visual Thinking Strategies online. Transcript of speech given in Lisbon, Portugal. Retrieved from <https://vtshome.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/08/5Eye-of-the-Beholder.pdf>

Institutional Authors

Alamo Heights Independent School District. (2018). GLAD Strategies. Retrieved from <http://www.ahisd.net/common/pages/UserFile.aspx?fileId=5074816>

American Education Research Association, American Psychological Association, & National Council on Measurement in Education. (1999). *Standards for educational and psychological testing*. Washington DC: American Educational Research Association.

Buck Institute of Education (BIE). (2018). Design: Online tools, rubrics, conferences, planning forms, student handouts, websites. Retrieved from <https://www.pblworks.org/what-is-pbl>

National Center for Education Statistics. (2011). *The nation's report card: US history 2010* (NCES 2011-468). Washington, DC: Institute of Education Sciences, U.S. Department of Education.

National Council for the Social Studies. (2010). Principles for learning: A foundation for transforming k-12 education. Retrieved from

PBL FOR ENGLISH LEARNERS IN SOCIAL STUDIES

https://www.socialstudies.org/sites/default/files/images/documents/Principles_for_Learning.pdf

National Council for the Social Studies. (2013). *The college, career, and civic life (C3) framework for social studies state standards: Guidance for enhancing the rigor of k-12. civics, economics, geography, and history*. Silver Spring, MD: NCSS. Retrieved from <https://www.socialstudies.org/sites/default/files/c3/C3-Framework-for-Social-Studies.pdf>

Visual Thinking Strategies (VTS). (2020). Visual thinking strategies: Online tools, research reports, writing samples, websites, conferences. Retrieved from <https://vtshome.org/aesthetic-development/>

Visual Thinking Strategies (<https://vtshome.org/aesthetic-development/>)

Appendix A
What is Your Learning Profile?
(¿Cuál es tu perfil de aprendizaje?)

Think about how you like to learn. Answer the questions below. <i>(Piensa en cómo te gusta aprender. Responda las siguientes preguntas.)</i>		
Instructions: Mark YES or NO to the questions below <i>(Marque Sí o NO en las preguntas siguientes)</i>	YES	NO
Do you like to work at a desk? <i>(¿Te gusta trabajar en un escritorio?)</i>		
Do you like to work on the floor? <i>(¿Te gusta trabajar en el suelo?)</i>		
Can you work in a noisy classroom? <i>(¿Puedes trabajar en un aula ruidosa?)</i>		
Do you get upset if you do not complete an assignment? <i>(¿Te molestan si no completas una tarea?)</i>		
Do you like working with a partner? <i>(¿Te gusta trabajar con un compañero?)</i>		
Do you like working in a group? <i>(¿Te gusta trabajar en grupo?)</i>		
Do you like using technology? <i>(¿Te gusta usar la tecnología?)</i>		
Write any other questions or comments you may have <i>(Escribe cualquier otra pregunta o comentario que puedas tener).</i>		

*Note: This template should be used at the beginning of PBL planning.

Appendix B
What is My Group Role?
(¿Cuál es mi función en el grupo?)

Materials Manager <i>(gerente de materiales)</i>	Speaker <i>(altavoz del grupo)</i>	Recorder <i>(grabador)</i>	Timekeeper <i>(cronometrador)</i>	Coordinator <i>(coordinador)</i>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In charge of gathering and returning supplies. • Participates in group discussions and research. • <i>Encargado de recoger y devolver materiales.</i> • <i>Participa en discusiones grupales e investigaciones.</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Presents for the group and asks the teacher questions. • Participates in group discussions and research. • <i>Presenta para el grupo y hace preguntas al maestro.</i> • <i>Participa en discusiones grupales e investigaciones.</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Does the notetaking for the group. • Participates in group discussions and research. • <i>Hace la toma de notas para el grupo.</i> • <i>Participa en discusiones grupales e investigaciones.</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Encourages the group to stay on task and keeps track of time. • Participates in group discussions and research. • <i>Anima al grupo a permanecer en la tarea y mantiene un registro del tiempo.</i> • <i>Participa en discusiones grupales e investigaciones.</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Starts group discussions. • Makes sure every member is heard. • Encourages everyone to do their best. • Participates in group discussions and research. • <i>Inicia las discusiones grupales.</i> • <i>Se asegura de que todos los miembros sean escuchados.</i> • <i>Alienta a todos a dar lo mejor de sí.</i> • <i>Participa en discusiones grupales e investigaciones.</i>

*Note: This template may be used as needed to support student throughout PBL. It may also be placed on a wall as a reminder of group roles and responsibilities.

Appendix C

7 Positions of Win-Win

What is Your Position?

(¿Cuál es tu posición?)

Instructions: Think about how you feel. How can you communicate your feelings? Answer the questions below the table. Select a strategy to Win-Win or come up with your own idea.

(Piensa en cómo te sientes. ¿Cómo puedes comunicar tus sentimientos? Responda las preguntas debajo de la tabla. Selecciona una estrategia para ganar-ganar o llegar a tu propia idea).

How I feel (cómo me siento)	My Position (mi posición)	How can I communicate my feelings to Win-Win? (¿Cómo puedo comunicar mis sentimientos para ganar-ganar?)
I have something to say or share <i>(Tengo algo que decir o compartir).</i>	Attention Seeker <i>(buscador de atención)</i>	I can communicate information to my group <i>(Puedo comunicar información a mi grupo).</i>
I don't like to make mistakes <i>(No me gusta cometer errores).</i>	Avoiding Failure <i>(evitar el fracaso)</i>	I can ask my peers for help <i>(Puedo pedir ayuda a mis compañeros).</i>
I feel frustrated. <i>(Me siento frustrado.)</i>	Angry <i>(enojado)</i>	I can ask for a break when needed. <i>(Puedo pedir un descanso cuando sea necesario.)</i>
I like to help. <i>(Me gusta ayudar.)</i>	Control Seeking <i>(búsqueda de control)</i>	I can help keep our group on task with reminders. <i>(Puedo ayudar a mantener a nuestro grupo en la tarea con recordatorios.)</i>
I need to move around. <i>(Necesito moverme.)</i>	Energetic <i>(enérgico)</i>	I can lead brain breaks. <i>(Puedo lidiar los descansos cerebrales.)</i>
I need to be challenged. <i>(Tengo que ser desafiado.)</i>	Bored <i>(aburrido)</i>	I can choose or ask for a more challenging assignment. <i>(Puedo elegir o pedir una tarea más difícil.)</i>
I don't understand. <i>(No entiendo.)</i>	Uninformed <i>(desinformado)</i>	I can ask my shoulder partner or team member for help. <i>(Puedo pedir ayuda a mi compañero de hombro o miembro del equipo.)</i>
1. I feel . . . (Me siento . . .)	2. My Position (mi posición)	3. To Win-Win, I will . . . (Para ganar-ganar, yo . . .)

*Note: This template may be used as needed to support student coping skills throughout PBL. It may also be placed on a wall as a reminder for students to take action of their behavior. Adapted by the author from Win-Win Discipline (Kagan, Kyle, & Scott, 2004)

Appendix D
What Do You See?
(¿Qué ves?)

Instructions: Look at the picture. What does it make you think about? Answer the questions below. You may use complete sentences or make a list.

(Mira la foto. ¿En qué te hace pensar? Responde las siguientes preguntas. Puede usar oraciones completas o hacer una lista.)

1. What is going on in the picture? <i>(¿Qué está sucediendo en la foto?)</i>	2. What do you see that makes you say that? <i>(¿Qué ves que te hace decir eso?)</i>	3. What more can you find? <i>(¿Qué más puedes encontrar?)</i>

*Note: This template may be used to activate and build on students' prior knowledge. It should be used at the beginning and/or throughout PLB as needed. Adapted by the author from Visual Thinking Strategies, 2020 (Housen, 2002)

Appendix E

Key Vocabulary
(Vocabulario clave)

Instructions: Using the guide below, write your own definition for each key word, draw an image that describes each key word, provide a sentence that shows an example of each key word, and write a synonym for each key word.
(Usando la siguiente guía, escriba su propia definición para cada palabra clave, dibuje una imagen que describa cada palabra clave, proporcione una oración que muestre un ejemplo de cada palabra clave, y escriba un sinónimo para cada palabra clave.)

Key Words (palabra clave)	Meaning (significado)	Image (imagen)	Example (ejemplo)	Synonym (sinónimo)
Ex. culture	way of life, including customs and beliefs, of a group of people at a particular time		She is studying Japanese martial arts, language and culture.	civilization

*Note: This template should be used at the beginning stages of PBL. Each student should receive a copy to use as reference.
Adapted by the author from the Teaching Channel 2020 (Hilliker, 2017)

Appendix F
Daily Reflection Guide
(Guía de reflexión diaria)

Instructions: Think about how you managed your time with your team. Answer the questions below.
(Piensa en cómo dirigiste tu tiempo con tu equipo. Responda las siguientes preguntas).

1. What tasks did you accomplish today in completing your project? <i>(¿Qué tareas ha realizado hoy al completar su proyecto?)</i>
2. What task did you want to accomplish today, but were unable to? <i>(¿Qué tarea deseaba realizar hoy, pero no pudo hacerlo?)</i>
3. What changes could you make tomorrow to improve? <i>(¿Qué cambios podría hacer mañana para mejorar?)</i>
4. Did you work collaboratively with your team? <i>(¿Trabajaste en colaboración con tu equipo?)</i>
5. Was the work evenly divided among team members? <i>(¿El trabajo se dividió uniformemente entre los miembros del equipo?)</i>
6. What could your team do differently to complete the project on-time? <i>(¿Qué podría hacer su equipo de manera diferente para completar el proyecto a tiempo?)</i>
7. Other suggestions <i>(Otras sugerencias):</i>

*Note: This template should be used daily during PBL to reflect on project progress.
 Adapted by the author from PBLWorks.org (Buck Institute of Education, 2018)

Appendix G
Creating a Driving Question for PBL
(Creación de una pregunta para PBL)

Instructions: Using the guide below, write your thoughts and ideas to design a PBL question.
(Usando la siguiente guía, escribe tus pensamientos e ideas para diseñar una pregunta PBL).

Subject <i>(materia):</i>		
Team Members <i>(miembros del equipo):</i>		
Who, what, when, where, why, how <i>(quién, qué, dónde, cuándo, por qué, cómo)</i>	Who or what? <i>(quién o qué?)</i>	Takes action <i>(tomar medidas, actuar)</i>
What day of the week <i>(¿Qué día de la semana)</i>	do middle school students <i>(estudiantes de la escuela intermedia)</i>	play the most video games? <i>(juegan más videojuegos?)</i>
How does <i>(¿Cómo)</i>	someone <i>(alguien)</i>	improve their health? <i>(mejora su salud?)</i>
How can <i>(¿Cómo podemos)</i>	We <i>(nosotros)</i>	improve our communication with others? <i>(mejorar nuestra comunicación con los demás?)</i>

*Note: This template should be used at the beginning stages of PBL. Each student should receive a copy to record their own ideas.
 Adapted by the author from PBLWorks.org (Buck Institute of Education, 2018)

Appendix H
PBL Question Checklist
(Lista de verificación de preguntas PBL)

PBL Question (<i>pregunta de PBL</i>):		
Instructions: Mark YES or NO to the questions below. If you have marked an answer with NO review your question with your team members and make the changes needed to meet the criteria (<i>Marque SÍ o NO en las preguntas siguientes. Si ha marcado una respuesta con NO revisar su pregunta con los miembros de su equipo y realizar los cambios necesarios para cumplir con los criterios</i>).	YES	NO
Is the question clear and understandable? (<i>¿Es clara y comprensible la pregunta?</i>)		
Is the question relevant, challenging, and interesting? (<i>¿Es la pregunta relevante, desafiante e interesante?</i>)		
Is there more than one way to answer the question? (<i>¿Hay más de una manera de responder a la pregunta?</i>)		
Does the question relate to your local community? (<i>¿La pregunta se relaciona con su comunidad local?</i>)		
Does answering the question challenge you to take action? (<i>¿Te desafía responder a la pregunta a tomar medidas?</i>)		
Does the question lead you to ask more questions? (<i>¿La pregunta te lleva a hacer más preguntas?</i>)		
Other questions you may have (<i>Otras preguntas que puede tener</i>)		
Write any other questions you may have (<i>Escribe cualquier otra pregunta que puedas tener</i>).		

* Note: This template should be used at the beginning stages of PBL with group members.
 Adapted by the author from PBLWorks.org (Buck Institute of Education, 2018)

Appendix I Presenting Your Project

(Presentación de su Proyecto PBL)

Instructions: First, think about each team members strengths. Then, select from the following ideas below to present your project. Next, discuss the ideas with your team members. Add other ideas that are not listed. Lastly, decide on one or more ideas as a team. *(Primero, piense en las fortalezas de cada miembro del equipo. A continuación, seleccione entre las siguientes ideas para presentar su proyecto. A continuación, discuta las ideas con los miembros de su equipo. Agregue otras ideas que no estén listadas. Por último, decidir una o más ideas como equipo.)*

Performance (actuación)	Multimedia (multimedia)	Writing (escritura)	Visuals (visuales)	Building (construcción)
<input type="checkbox"/> Play (<i>obra de teatro</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Dance (<i>baile</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Debate (<i>debate</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Speech (<i>discurso</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Newscast (<i>noticiero</i>)	<input type="checkbox"/> Slideshow (<i>diapositiva</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Video (<i>video</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Website (<i>sitio web</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Animation (<i>animación</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Comic strip (<i>tira cómica</i>)	<input type="checkbox"/> Brochure (<i>folleto</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Poem (<i>poema</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Research Report (<i>informe de investigación</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Manual (<i>manual</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Letter (<i>carta</i>)	<input type="checkbox"/> Graph (<i>gráfico</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Photography (<i>fotografía</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Timeline (<i>línea de tiempo</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Experiment (<i>experimento</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Survey (<i>encuesta</i>)	<input type="checkbox"/> Model (<i>modelo</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Gallery Exhibit (<i>exposición de galería</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Machine (<i>máquina</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Instrument (<i>instrumento</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Garden (<i>jardín</i>)
Other ideas (<i>otras ideas</i>):				
Team Decision (<i>decisión del equipo</i>):				

*Note: This template should be used in PBL with group members to decide on how to present the project once the question has been established. Adapted by the author PBLWorks.org (Buck Institute of Education, 2018)

Appendix J

Resources Needed to Complete the Project
(Recursos necesarios para completar el Proyecto)

Instructions: To complete your project, with your group members think about the resources you will need. Check off the resources you have and circle the resources you need. *(Para completar su proyecto, con su equipo piensen en los recursos que necesitarán. Marquen los recursos que tienen y circulen los recursos que necesitan).*

Materials <i>(materiales)</i>	Technology <i>(tecnología)</i>	People <i>(gente)</i>	Community Assistance <i>(asistencia comunitaria)</i>
<input type="checkbox"/> Paper (<i>papel</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Magazines (<i>revistas</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Paint (<i>pintura</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Glue (<i>pegamento</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Scissors (<i>tijeras</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Display board (<i>cartulina</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Batteries (<i>baterías</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Other (<i>otras</i>):	<input type="checkbox"/> Computer (<i>ordenador</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Internet (<i>internet</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Projector (<i>proyector</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Speakers (<i>bocina</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> TV (<i>televisión</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Video Camera <i>(cámara de video)</i> <input type="checkbox"/> Printer (<i>impresora</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Other (<i>otras</i>):	<input type="checkbox"/> Classmates (<i>compañeros</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> School personnel <i>(personal de la escuela)</i> <input type="checkbox"/> Business owners <i>(propietarios de negocios)</i> <input type="checkbox"/> Public officials <i>(funcionarios públicos)</i> <input type="checkbox"/> Media support <i>(medios de comunicación)</i> <input type="checkbox"/> Public safety <i>(seguridad pública)</i> <input type="checkbox"/> Volunteers (<i>voluntarios</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Other (<i>otros</i>):	<input type="checkbox"/> Parks (<i>parques</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Library (<i>biblioteca</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Museum (<i>museo</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Law enforcement (<i>policía</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> YMCA <input type="checkbox"/> Garden Center <i>(centro de jardinería)</i> <input type="checkbox"/> Health Clinic <i>(clínica de salud)</i> <input type="checkbox"/> Other (<i>otros</i>):

*Note: This template should be used with group members to decide on the resources need.
 Adapted by the author PBLWorks.org (Buck Institute of Education, 2018)

Appendix K
Collaboration Evaluation
(Evaluación de la colaboración)

Instructions: Use this checklist to reflect on your collaboration skills and to assess your group.
(Utilice esta lista de comprobación para reflexionar sobre sus habilidades de colaboración y evaluar su grupo).

	Yourself	Team
Responsibility	<input type="checkbox"/> Prepared and ready to work (<i>preparado y listo para trabajar</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Communicates with team (<i>se comunica con el equipo</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Completes tasks on time (<i>realiza las tareas a tiempo</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Listens to feedback to improve work <i>(escucha los comentarios para mejorar el trabajo)</i> <input type="checkbox"/> Other (<i>otros</i>):	<input type="checkbox"/> Prepared and ready to work (<i>preparado y listo para trabajar</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Communicates with team (<i>se comunica con el equipo</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Completes tasks on time (<i>realiza las tareas a tiempo</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Listens to feedback to improve work <i>(escucha los comentarios para mejorar el trabajo)</i> <input type="checkbox"/> Other (<i>otros</i>):
Conduct	<input type="checkbox"/> Listens attentively (<i>escucha atentamente</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Polite and kind to all team members <i>(educado y amable con todos los miembros del equipo)</i> <input type="checkbox"/> Gives positive feedback to all team members <i>(da comentarios positivos a todos los miembros del equipo)</i> <input type="checkbox"/> Helps to solve problems (<i>ayuda para resolver problemas</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Other (<i>otros</i>):	<input type="checkbox"/> Listens attentively (<i>escucha atentamente</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Polite and kind to all team members <i>(educado y amable con todos los miembros del equipo)</i> <input type="checkbox"/> Gives positive feedback to all team members <i>(da comentarios positivos a todos los miembros del equipo)</i> <input type="checkbox"/> Helps to solve problems (<i>ayuda para resolver problemas</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Other (<i>otros</i>):
Teamwork	<input type="checkbox"/> Contributes to group discussions <i>(contribuye a las discusiones de grupo)</i> <input type="checkbox"/> Stays on task (<i>permanece en la tarea</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Helps other group members (<i>ayuda a otros miembros del grupo</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Other (<i>otros</i>):	<input type="checkbox"/> Contributes to group discussions <i>(contribuye a las discusiones de grupo)</i> <input type="checkbox"/> Stays on task (<i>permanece en la tarea</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Helps other group members (<i>ayuda a otros miembros del grupo</i>) <input type="checkbox"/> Other (<i>otros</i>):
What is one area that you need to improve on? How can you improve it? (<i>¿Cuál es un área que necesita mejorar? ¿Cómo puedes mejorarlo?</i>)		

*Note: This template should be used at the ending stages of PBL. Each student should receive their own template to evaluate themselves and group members. Adapted by the author PBLWorks.org (Buck Institute of Education, 2018)

Appendix L

PBL Project Presentation Rubric

(Rúbrica de Presentación del Proyecto PBL)

	Exceeds Standard <i>(Excede el estándar)</i> 4	At Standard <i>(En el estándar)</i> 3	Approaching Standard <i>(Acercándose al estándar)</i> 2	Below Standard <i>(Debajo del estándar)</i> 1
Introduction of Project <i>(Introducción del Proyecto)</i>	The purpose of the project is clearly stated with extensive descriptive details. An extensive summary and preview of the project is provided using appropriate facts and relevant information. <i>(El propósito del proyecto se indica claramente con amplios detalles descriptivos. Se proporciona un amplio resumen y una vista previa del proyecto utilizando los hechos apropiados y la información relevante.)</i>	The purpose of the project is clearly stated with details. A summary of the project is provided using appropriate facts and relevant information. <i>(El propósito del proyecto se indica. Se proporciona un resumen del proyecto.)</i>	The purpose of the project is stated. A summary of the project is provided using some appropriate facts, and some irrelevant information. <i>(Se indica el propósito del proyecto. Se proporciona un resumen del proyecto utilizando algunos hechos apropiados y cierta información irrelevante.)</i>	The purpose of the project is not clearly stated. A minimal summary of the project is provided uses inappropriate facts and irrelevant information. <i>(El propósito del proyecto no está claramente indicado. Un resumen mínimo del proyecto se proporciona utiliza hechos inapropiados e información irrelevante.)</i>
Organization	Information is presented in an organized manner with exceptional details. Evidence for answering the project question is provided with extensive details. Team	Information is presented in an organized manner. Evidence for answering the project question is provided. Team members are prepared for questions and respond confidently.	Information is presented but is not always in an organized manner. Evidence for answering the project question is provided but does not always make sense. Some	Information is not presented in an organized manner. Minimal evidence for answering the project question is provided. Team

	Exceeds Standard <i>(Excede el estándar)</i> 4	At Standard <i>(En el estándar)</i> 3	Approaching Standard <i>(Acercándose al estándar)</i> 2	Below Standard <i>(Debajo del estándar)</i> 1
	<p>members are prepared for questions and respond confidently providing examples.</p> <p><i>(La información se presenta de forma organizada con detalles excepcionales. La evidencia para responder a la pregunta del proyecto se proporciona con amplios detalles. Los miembros del equipo están preparados para las preguntas y responden con confianza proporcionando ejemplos.)</i></p>	<p><i>(La información se presenta de forma organizada. Se proporcionan pruebas para responder a la pregunta del proyecto. Los miembros del equipo están preparados para responder a las preguntas y responden con confianza.)</i></p>	<p>team members are prepared for questions and respond.</p> <p><i>(La información se presenta, pero no siempre es de manera organizada. Se proporcionan pruebas para responder a la pregunta del proyecto, pero no siempre tiene sentido. Algunos miembros del equipo están preparados para las preguntas y responden.)</i></p>	<p>members are not prepared for questions and do not respond.</p> <p><i>(La información no se presenta de manera organizada. Se proporcionan pruebas mínimas para responder a la pregunta del proyecto. Los miembros del equipo no están preparados para las preguntas y no responden.)</i></p>
Conclusion	<p>The answer to the project is clearly communicated with extensive details. A summary and research is provided with several details. A call to action is expressed and communicated with conviction.</p> <p><i>(La respuesta al proyecto se comunica claramente con amplios detalles. Un resumen y la investigación se</i></p>	<p>The answer to the project is clearly communicated. A summary or research is provided. A call to action is expressed.</p> <p><i>(La respuesta al proyecto está claramente comunicada. Se proporciona un resumen o una investigación. Se expresa una llamada a la acción.)</i></p>	<p>The answer to the project is communicated. A summary or research is provided but does not always make sense. A call to action is expressed but is not clear.</p> <p><i>(Se comunica la respuesta al proyecto. Se proporciona un resumen o investigación, pero no siempre tiene sentido. Se expresa una llamada a la acción, pero no está clara.)</i></p>	<p>The answer to the project is not clearly communicated. A summary or research is not provided. A call to action is not expressed.</p> <p><i>(La respuesta al proyecto no está claramente comunicada. No se proporciona un resumen o una investigación. No se expresa una llamada a la acción.)</i></p>

	Exceeds Standard <i>(Excede el estándar)</i> 4	At Standard <i>(En el estándar)</i> 3	Approaching Standard <i>(Acercándose al estándar)</i> 2	Below Standard <i>(Debajo del estándar)</i> 1
	<i>proporciona con varios detalles. Una llamada a la acción se expresa y se comunica con convicción.)</i>			
Presentation	<p>All team members participate in presenting to the audience with confident posture. The project is focused on the topic using advanced audio/visual aids. Team members demonstrate a high level of maturity and eye contact throughout presentation.</p> <p><i>(Todos los miembros del equipo participan en la presentación a la audiencia con una postura segura. El proyecto se centra en el tema utilizando ayudas audiovisuales avanzadas. Los miembros del equipo demuestran un alto nivel de madurez y contacto visual durante la presentación.)</i></p>	<p>All team members participate in presenting to the audience. The project is focused on the topic using audio/visual aids. Team members demonstrate maturity and eye contact.</p> <p><i>(Todos los miembros del equipo participan en la presentación a la audiencia. El proyecto se centra en el tema utilizando ayudas audiovisuales. Los miembros del equipo demuestran madurez y contacto visual.)</i></p>	<p>Majority of team members participate in presenting to the audience. The project is not always focused on the topic. Most team members demonstrate maturity and some eye contact.</p> <p><i>(La mayoría de los miembros del equipo participan en la presentación a la audiencia. El proyecto no siempre se centra en el tema. La mayoría de los miembros del equipo demuestran madurez y algún contacto visual.)</i></p>	<p>Not all team members participate in presenting to the audience. The project is not focused on the topic. Team members do not demonstrate maturity or eye contact.</p> <p><i>(No todos los miembros del equipo participan en la presentación a la audiencia. El proyecto no se centra en el tema. Los miembros del equipo no demuestran madurez ni contacto visual.)</i></p>

	Exceeds Standard <i>(Excede el estándar)</i> 4	At Standard <i>(En el estándar)</i> 3	Approaching Standard <i>(Acercándose al estándar)</i> 2	Below Standard <i>(Debajo del estándar)</i> 1
Writing	<p>All team members contributed to the written part of the project utilizing extensive descriptive details. Project is well organized with extensive details. There are no spelling errors.</p> <p><i>(Todos los miembros del equipo contribuyeron a la parte escrita del proyecto utilizando amplios detalles descriptivos. El proyecto está bien organizado con amplios detalles. No hay errores ortográficos.)</i></p>	<p>All team members contributed to the written part of the project. Project is well organized. There are minimal spelling errors.</p> <p><i>(Todos los miembros del equipo contribuyeron a la parte escrita del proyecto. El proyecto está bien organizado. Hay errores ortográficos mínimos.)</i></p>	<p>Team members contributed to the written part of the project with there are several spelling errors. Most of the project is well organized.</p> <p><i>(Los miembros del equipo contribuyeron a la parte escrita del proyecto con varios errores ortográficos. La mayor parte del proyecto está bien organizado.)</i></p>	<p>Team members contributed minimally to the written part of the project. Project is not well organized. There are extensive spelling errors.</p> <p><i>(Pocos miembros del equipo contribuyeron a la parte escrita del proyecto. El proyecto no está bien organizado. Hay extensos errores ortográficos.)</i></p>
21st Century Skills	<p>Effective communication among team members is evident throughout the project. Collaboration with people beyond the classroom is extensive throughout the project. Advanced technology skills are incorporated in the project.</p> <p><i>(La comunicación efectiva entre los miembros del</i></p>	<p>Effective communication among team members. Collaboration with people beyond the classroom. Technology skills are incorporated in the project.</p> <p><i>(Comunicación efectiva entre los miembros del equipo. Colaboración con personas más allá del aula. Las habilidades tecnológicas se incorporan en el proyecto.)</i></p>	<p>Team members communicate with some struggles. There is an effort to collaborate with people beyond the classroom. Some technology skills are incorporated in the project.</p> <p><i>(Los miembros del equipo se comunican con algunas dificultades. Hay un esfuerzo para colaborar con personas más allá del aula. Algunas</i></p>	<p>Communication among team members is minimal. Collaboration with people beyond the classroom is minimal or nonexistent. Technology skills are not incorporated in the project.</p> <p><i>(La comunicación entre los miembros del equipo es mínima. La colaboración con personas más allá del aula es mínima o inexistente. Las</i></p>

	Exceeds Standard <i>(Excede el estándar)</i> 4	At Standard <i>(En el estándar)</i> 3	Approaching Standard <i>(Acercándose al estándar)</i> 2	Below Standard <i>(Debajo del estándar)</i> 1
	<i>equipo es evidente a lo largo del proyecto. La colaboración con personas más allá del aula es extensa a lo largo del proyecto. Las habilidades tecnológicas avanzadas se incorporan en el proyecto.)</i>		<i>habilidades tecnológicas se incorporan en el proyecto.)</i>	<i>habilidades tecnológicas no se incorporan en el proyecto.)</i>

*Note: This template should be used at all stages of PBL. Each student should receive their own template to evaluate themselves and group members to reassure they are meeting the criteria and expectations of the PBL process.

Adapted by the author PBLWorks.org (Buck Institute of Education, 2018)